IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN

ORA EZELL,)
Plaintiff,) JUDGE : Edmunds, Nancy G. DECK : S. Division Civil Deck
v.	DATE : 06/07/2004 @ 14:40:39 CASE NUMBER : 2:04CV72119
SHERMAN ACQUISITION II, LP; SHERMAN ACQUISITION II) CMP ORA EZELL V SHERMAN) ACQUISITON ET AL (DQH))
GENERAL PARTNER LLC; NATIONAL ACTION)
FINANCIAL SERVICES, INC.;	MAGISTRATE JUDGE DONALD A. SCHEER
Defendants.	

COMPLAINT - CLASS ACTION

INTRODUCTION

1. Plaintiff brings this action to secure redress against unlawful credit and collection practices engaged in by defendants Sherman Acquisition II, LP ("SA2"), Sherman Acquisition II General Partner, LLC ("SA2GP"), and National Action Financial Services, Inc. ("NAFS"). SA2 purchases charged-off credit card debts for between two and three cents on the dollar and attempts to collect them, using misleading collection letters sent out under the name of NAFS, a collection agency. SA2GP is the general partner of SA2. Plaintiff alleges a violation of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. §1692 et seq. ("FDCPA").

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 2. This Court has jurisdiction under 28 U.S.C. §§1331, 1337 and 15 U.S.C. §1692k (FDCPA).
 - 3. Venue in this District is proper because:
 - a. Plaintiff resides here;

- b. Defendants do business here;
- c. Defendants' collection communications were transmitted into the District.

PARTIES

Plaintiff

4. Plaintiff Ora Ezell is an individual who resides in Detroit, Michigan.

Defendants

- 5. Defendant SA2 is a Delaware limited partnership entity. Its registered agent is Corporation Trust Company, 1209 Orange St., Wilmington, DE 19801.
- 6. Defendant SA2 is in the business of buying bad debts allegedly owed by consumers, including large amounts of credit card debts, for a small fraction of face value and enforcing the debts against the consumers.
- 7. SA2 is a debt collector as defined in the FDCPA. It is part of the Sherman Financial Group ("SFG").
- 8. SFG hired NAFS to collect bad debts it purchased in States including Michigan.
- 9. Defendant SA2GP is a Delaware limited liability company. It is the general partner of SA2. Its registered agent is Corporation Trust Company, 1209 Orange St., Wilmington, DE 19801.
- 10. Defendant NAFS is a corporation with its principal place of business located at 165 Lawrence Bell Drive, Suite 100, Williamsville, NY 14231. It operates a collection agency and is a "debt collector" as defined in the FDCPA. It does business in Michigan.

FACTS RELATING TO PLAINTIFF EZELL

- 11. On or about Feb. 13, 2004, NAFS sent plaintiff Ezell the collection letter attached as Exhibit A, seeking to collect a debt incurred for personal, family or household purposes. Plaintiff received it a few days later.
 - 12. Exhibit A is a form letter.
 - 13. NAFS sent Exhibit A on behalf of SA2, as its authorized collection agent.
- 14. <u>Exhibit A</u> states that "Sherman has advised us that interest will continue to accrue on your account as provided for in your agreement with the original credit grantor."
 - 15. This language was approved or supplied by SA2.

VIOLATION ALLEGED

- 16. Exhibit A states a balance and further states that interest will continue to accrue.
- 17. Exhibit A does not state as of what date the balance given applies, or how long it is valid for.
- 18. Exhibit A insists that "the entire balance due" must be paid. The implication of the statement that interest is continuing to accrue is that the balance stated is <u>not</u> the entire balance due.
- 19. None of the letters contains the "safe harbor" language approved in <u>Chuway</u>
 v. National Action Financial Services, 362 F.3d 944 (7th Cir., Ill. March 30, 2004).
- 20. As a result, each of the letters is confusing to the unsophisticated consumer, in that it states that the debt will increase, but does not explain how the consumer should determine

what to pay, in violation of 15 U.S.C. §1692e, and/or fails to coherently inform the consumer of the amount of the debt, in violation of 15 U.S.C. §1692g.

CLASS ALLEGATIONS

- 21. Plaintiff brings this claim on behalf of 2 classes, designated SA2 and NAFS.
- 22. Class SA is defined with respect to SA2. It consists of all natural persons with Michigan addresses who satisfy the following criteria:
 - a. SA2 owned their alleged credit card debt;
- b. A letter was sent to the person which (i) stated a balance due, (ii) did not state the date as of which the balance was stated, (iii) stated that the debt was accruing interest as provided for in the debtor's agreement with the original credit grantor, (iv) demanded payment of the "balance" or "entire balance" due, and (v) did not contain the "safe harbor" language specified in Chuway.
- c. The letter was sent on or after a date one year prior to the filing of this action and before April 10, 2004.
- 23. Class NAFS is defined with respect to NAFS. It consists of all natural persons with Michigan addresses who satisfy the following criteria:
 - a. NAFS sent them a letter seeking to collect a credit card debt;
- b. The letter (i) stated a balance due, (ii) did not state the date as of which the balance was stated, (iii) stated that the debt was accruing interest as provided for in the debtor's agreement with the original credit grantor, (iv) demanded payment of the "balance" or "entire balance" due, and (v) did not contain the "safe harbor" language specified in Chuway.
 - c. The letter was sent on or after a date one year prior to the filing of this

action and before April 10, 2004.

24. The class members are so numerous that joinder is impracticable. On information and belief, there are more than 50 members of each class.

25. There are questions of law and fact common to the class members, which common questions predominate over any questions that affect only individual class members. The predominant common question is whether the collection letters at issue violate the FDCPA.

26. Plaintiff will fairly and adequately represent the interests of the class members. Plaintiff has retained counsel experienced in consumer credit and debt collection abuse cases.

27. A class action is an appropriate means of adjudicating this dispute. Individual cases are not economically feasible.

WHEREFORE, plaintiff requests that the Court enter judgment in favor of plaintiff and the class members and against defendants for:

a. Statutory damages (\$1,000 to plaintiff and the lesser of \$500,000 or 1% of net worth for the class) against each defendant;

b. Attorney's fees, litigation expenses and costs of suit;

c. Such other or further relief as the Court deems proper.

Lynn H. Shecter

Lynn H. Shecter ROY, SHECTER & VOCHT, P.C. 36700 Woodward Avenue, Suite 205 Bloomfield Hills, MI 48304 (248) 540-7660 (248) 540-0321 (FAX) shecter@rsmv.com

Daniel A. Edelman
Cathleen M. Combs
James O. Latturner
Jeremy P. Monteiro
EDELMAN, COMBS & LATTURNER, LLC
120 S. LaSalle Street, 18th Floor
Chicago, Illinois 60603
(312) 739-4200
(312) 419-0379 (FAX)
jmonteiro@edcombs.com

JURY DEMAND

Plaintiff demands trial by jury.

Lynn H. Shecter

J:\case\nation-ezell11,966\pleading\cmplt.wpd

A-

FORWARDING SERVICE REQUESTED



FEB 13 2004

47764180
Idalia da de la della della

Please check box if above address is incorrect and indicate change(s) on reverso.



A171

KL51

150

NAFS

National Action Financial Services, Inc.

1-716-565-1020 1-877-829-7982 Fax 716-565-1041

Previous Creditor: Montgomery Ward - WM

FLIP[™]C

P.02

Current Creditor: Sherman Acquisition II

Account Number:

Balance: \$3424.67

NATIONAL ACTION FINANCIAL SERVICES PO BOX 9027
WILLIAMSVILLE, NY 14231-9027

▼ Flease detach and return top portion with your payment.

Dear Ora Ezell:

Sherman Acquisition II LP has purchased the above referenced account from the above referenced Previous Creditor. Sherman has placed your account with this agency for collection. Sherman has advised us that interest will continue to accrue on your account as provided for in your agreement with the original credit grantor.

We recognize you may have experienced difficult circumstances that prevented you from repaying this obligation as originally agreed. Please remit the entire balance due to our office using the return envelope provided. If you have any questions or wish to discuss your account with one of our representatives, please call our toll-free number at 1-877-829-7982.

This is an attempt to collect a debt and any information obtained will be used for that purpose. This is a communication from a debt collector.

Unless you notify this office within 30 days after receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of the debt or any portion thereof, this office will assume this debt is valid. If you notify this office in writing within 30 days from receiving this notice, this office will obtain verification of the debt or obtain a copy of a judgement and mail you a copy of such judgement or verification. If you request this office in writing within 30 days after receiving this notice, this office will provide you with the name and address of the original credit grantor, if different from the current credit grantor.

NATIONAL ACTION FINANCIAL SERVICES, INC., 165 LAWRENCE BELL DRIVE, STE 100, P.O. BOX 9027. WILLIAMSVILLE. NY 14231-9027.

SEE REVERSE SIDE FOR IMPORTANT PRIVACY NOTIFICATION FROM YOUR CREDITOR.

6.7.04

MUNN H. Sheater

Case 2:04-cv-72119-NGE-DAS: Document 1 Filed 06/07/04 Page 11 of 11

PURSUANT TO LOCAL RULE 83.11

1.	Is this a case that has been previously dismissed?	Yes
If yes, give	the following information:	☐ No
Co u rt:		
Case No.:		
Judge:		
2.	Other than stated above, are there any pending or previously discontinued or dismissed companion cases in this or any other court, including state court? (Companion cases are matters in which it appears substantially similar evidence will be offered or the same or related parties are present and the cases arise out of the same transaction or occurrence.)	Yes No
If yes, give	the following information:	
Court:		
Case No.:		
Judge:		
Notes:		
	·	